

---

*Who were the Parents of Robert Emil Garnier, who Died 29 May 1945 in Queens, New York?*

---

Discovering the identities of an immigrant's parents can prove to be a challenge, especially if those parents remained behind in their home country or if the immigrant may have changed their name after reaching America. Records created in the United States after an immigrant's arrival may provide answers to these forgotten relationships, but are they reliable?

### Background Information

While Germans had long been settling in America, the 1880s was the decade which recorded the highest levels of German immigration. Approximately 1.5 million Germans reached American shores during that decade, with a peak of 250,000 migrants in 1882 alone.<sup>1</sup>

Robert Emil Garnier was one of those many German immigrants arriving in 1882. Born in Germany on 9 November 1865, he arrived in the United States between 16-17 years of age.<sup>2</sup> Family lore stated that his passage was sponsored by a wealthy benefactor who needed assistance making

---

<sup>1</sup> *Library of Congress*, "The Germans in America: Chronology," (<https://www.loc.gov/rr/european/imde/germchro.html> : accessed 14 October 2021).

<sup>2</sup> For immigration year, 1900 U.S. census, King Co, New York, population schedule, Borough of Brooklyn, 25<sup>th</sup> ward, enumeration district (ED) 432, sheet no. 5, dwelling 65, family 111, Robert Garnier household; online database with image, *Ancestry* ([www.ancestry.com](http://www.ancestry.com) : accessed 14 October 2021); citing NARA microfilm T623, roll 1062.

Also, 1910 U.S. census, Kings Co., New York, population schedule, Borough of Brooklyn, 25<sup>th</sup> ward, ED 689, Sheet 14B, dwelling 138, family 317, Robert E. Garnier household [indexed as Sarnier]; online database with images, *Ancestry* ([www.ancestry.com](http://www.ancestry.com) : accessed 14 October 2021); citing NARA microfilm publication T624, roll 973.

Also, 1930 U.S. census, Queens Co., New York, population schedule, Hollis, 4<sup>th</sup> ward, ED 41-1245, Sheet 9A, p. 229 (stamped), dwelling 163, family 173, Robert E. Garnier; online database with images, *Ancestry* ([www.ancestry.com](http://www.ancestry.com) : accessed 14 October 2021); citing NARA microfilm publication T626, roll 1600.

For date of birth, Borough of Queens, New York, Department of Health, death certificate, certificate no. 4381 (1945), Robert E. Garnier.

No passenger records for Robert Emil Garnier have been located. Databases searched include "Hamburg Passenger Lists, 1850-1934", *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/2452/> : accessed 16 October 2021), "New York, U.S., Arriving Passenger and Crew Lists (including Castle Garden and Ellis Island), 1820-1957," *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/7488/> : accessed 16 October 2021), "Baltimore Passenger Lists, 1820-1964," *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/8679/> : accessed 18 November 2021), "U.S. Atlantic Ports Arriving and Departing Passenger and Crew Lists, 1820-1959," *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/8758/> : accessed 18 November 2021), and "Massachusetts, U.S., Arriving Passenger and Crew Lists, 1820-1963," *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/8745/> : accessed 18 November 2021). Search terms included names Robert Garnier, Emil Garnier, Garnier with birthplace of Germany and arrival date of 1882 +/- 2 years. No relevant results noted.

the voyage.<sup>3</sup> He married Augusta Kornstedt, another German immigrant, in Jersey City, New Jersey, in 1886.<sup>4</sup> Together they had two children, Elsie Elizabeth Garnier in 1887 and Robert Irving Garnier in 1895.<sup>5</sup> Robert Emil became a United States citizen in 1892, attesting that he had arrived in the U.S. when under the age of 18.<sup>6</sup>

Robert Emil Garnier died in Queens, New York on 29 May 1945.<sup>7</sup> On his death certificate, his widow identified his father as a man named Emil.<sup>8</sup> The logical analysis of other evidence, however, shows that Robert Emil's parents had most likely been Frederic Alexandre Garnier and his second wife, Marie Marguerite Lotz of Friedrichsdorf, Germany.

### Evidence of a Life Well-Lived

Augusta and Robert Emil seem to have lived a long and happy life together. A newspaper article published on the couple in November 1936 noted the celebration of their golden, or 50<sup>th</sup>, wedding anniversary, having married on 5 November, 1886, in Jersey City, New Jersey.<sup>9</sup> It reported that they had lived in or near Brooklyn since 1889, with two adult married children, grandchildren and a great-grandchild. In his younger days, Mr. Garnier had been a portrait painter, and followed that with a successful career in sales, from which he had retired. The article also mentioned that the Garnier family had originally been French Huguenots (or French Protestants) that had fled from violent persecution in France for safety in Germany in the late 1600s.<sup>10</sup>

Various pieces of evidence support the article's mention of their marriage occurring in 1886, but sources disagree as to the specific date. An index of New Jersey marriages lists that a Robt. E.

---

<sup>3</sup> April Poitras, Arlington, Texas [email address for private use], to Michelle Torosian, email, 24 January 2018, "Emile Robert Garnier," Garnier Family file, privately held by Torosian [mictorosian@yahoo.com, [street address for private use] Briarcliff Manor, New York.

<sup>4</sup> "New Jersey, Marriage Records, 1670-1965" database, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/discoveryui-content/view/658457:61376?ssrc=pt&tid=116338474&pid=380145244150> : accessed 14 October 2021), entry for Robt. E. Garnier – Auguste Kornstedt, 24 May 1886, Jersey City, New Jersey. Per the Jersey City Clerk, no records from this time period remain in their possession. At the time of this writing, an order placed for this marriage record with the New Jersey State Archives is still outstanding.

<sup>5</sup> For Elsie's birth and parentage, Social Security Administration, "U.S., Social Security Applications and Claims Index, 1936-2007" database, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/discoveryui-content/view/16056141:60901?ssrc=pt&tid=116338474&pid=380145244155> : accessed 14 October 2021), entry for Elsie Garnier See, Social Security number 059-52-8410.

For Robert Irving's date of birth, Vital Statistics, State Board of Health, South Carolina, death certificate, state file No. 64 002430 (1964), Robert Irving Garnier; "South Carolina, U.S., Death Records, 1821-1969," online database with images, *Ancestry* ([www.ancestry.com](http://www.ancestry.com) : accessed 14 October 2021).

<sup>6</sup> Kings County, New York, County Court, vol. 240, page 118, certificate of naturalization, Roberd [sic] E. Garnier, 1892; "New York, U.S., State and Federal Naturalization Records, 1794-1943," online database with images, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/2280/> : accessed 20 November 2021).

<sup>7</sup> Borough of Queens, New York, Department of Health, death certificate, certificate no. 4381 (1945), Robert E. Garnier.

<sup>8</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>9</sup> Mrs. H. Sundelof, "Golden Years", *The Brooklyn Daily Eagle* (New York), 14 November 1936, page 5, column 1; online database with images, *Newspapers.com* ([www.newspapers.com](http://www.newspapers.com) : accessed 15 October 2021).

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid.*

Garnier married an Auguste Kornstedt not in November, but on 24 May 1886.<sup>11</sup> This contrasts with the 5 November date recorded in the family bible, the newspaper article published at the time of their 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary, as well as an original invitation to the party celebrating their golden anniversary.<sup>12</sup> It is possible the earlier May date was when the couple applied for a civil wedding license, and the ceremony was held five months later in November. As a derivative record, the marriage index could be incorrect.

Another factor supporting a possible delay in the marriage could be the legal age requirement related to marriage. In the state of New Jersey at this time, the minimum legal age for males to marry was 21 years, or younger with the permission of a parent or legal guardian.<sup>13</sup> If Robert Emil immigrated here without his parents, as family lore suggested, he may not have had anyone able to sign for him. With a date of birth of 9 November 1865, he would have been just four days shy of 21 years of age on 5 November 1886.<sup>14</sup>

A marriage license or certificate could clarify the date and be reasonably expected to list the names of the bride's and groom's parents. During this time period in New Jersey, the law stated that the marriage officiant was to file the marriage certificate to the Common Pleas' clerk within six months of the wedding.<sup>15</sup> Town clerks were also to keep a marriage register of all reported marriages.<sup>16</sup> At this time, however, these have not been able to be located.<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>11</sup> "New Jersey, Marriage Records, 1670-1965" database, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/discoveryui-content/view/658457:61376?ssrc=pt&tid=116338474&pid=380145244150> : accessed 14 October 2021), entry for Robt. E. Garnier – Auguste Kornstedt, 24 May 1886, Jersey City, New Jersey.

<sup>12</sup> Garnier Family Bible Records 1865-1967, *The Holy Bible* (Publisher and location unknown, 1886), "Marriages"; privately held by Warren A. Garnier, Jr, [address for private use], Columbus, New Jersey, 2018. Various penmanship and ink colors indicate that entries were made separately over various years. One "Bonds of Holy Matrimony" page which remains unfilled has the year 188[blank] preprinted, indicating the bible may have been purchased during that decade. Photographs taken of and provided by Warren Garnier, Jr. to Michelle Torosian 16 October 2021 indicate that several pages at the front of Bible are missing, including that which listed the publisher and place of publication. Other pages indicate publishing date of 1886.

Sundelof, "Golden Years," *Brooklyn Daily Eagle*, 14 November 1936, p. 5, col. 1.

Mr. and Mrs. Robert E. Garnier, Golden Anniversary party invitation party date of "Sat. evening, Nov. 7<sup>th</sup>," Brooklyn, New York; privately held by April (Garnier) Poitras [address for private use], Arlington, Texas, 2021. Invitation had been owned by April's father, Warren Garnier, who was grandson of Robert and Augusta Garnier and attended the party. November 7<sup>th</sup> was a Saturday in 1936 according to 1936 calendar available at (<https://www.timeanddate.com/calendar/?year=1936&country=1> : accessed 16 October 2021).

<sup>13</sup> A.V.D. Honeyman, *An Abridgment of the Revised Statutes of New Jersey and of the Amended Constitution* (Somerville, New Jersey: Honeyman & Rowe, 1878), p. 224; digital images, *HathiTrust* (<https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.35112203950227&view=page&seq=236&skin=2021&q1=marriage> : accessed 16 October 2021). After 1878, New Jersey next complied its statutes in 1895, so this printing would be in effect in 1886. See Judy G. Russell, "Garden State Laws of Yore," *The Legal Genealogist*, 16 August 2017 (<https://www.legalgenealogist.com/2017/08/16/garden-state-laws-of-yore/> : accessed 16 October 2021).

<sup>14</sup> Borough of Queens, New York, Department of Health, death certificate, certificate no. 4381 (1945), Robert E. Garnier.

<sup>15</sup> Honeyman, *Revised Statutes of New Jersey*, 224-225.

<sup>16</sup> Honeyman, *Revised Statutes of New Jersey*, 224-225.

<sup>17</sup> Per phone conversation on 19 October 2021 with the Jersey City clerk's office, marriage records prior to about 1913 were sent to the New Jersey State Archives and are no longer kept locally. Phone messages traded with St Paul's Evangelical Lutheran Church and email sent, but no response received as of 24 November 2021. Order placed

Robert Emil died in May of 1945. His widow, Augusta, signed the death certificate as the informant.<sup>18</sup> The death certificate lists Robert Emil's place of birth as Friedricdorf, Germany to father Emil, born in Germany, and a mother who was born in Germany but whose name was unknown.<sup>19</sup> The information would have almost certainly been secondhand to Augusta, who herself immigrated from Germany to the United States as a girl.<sup>20</sup>

## German Birthplace

A city, town or village with the spelling Friedricdorf was not found in Germany; however, eight results all with the spelling Friedrichsdorf were noted.<sup>21</sup> Of these, only one was a town itself, the others were smaller geographic localities. This town of Friedrichsdorf is located in the district of Hochtaunuskries, in the state of Hesse.<sup>22</sup> Most notably, this town is known for its founding by French Huguenots.<sup>23</sup> This seems consistent with the French surname Garnier carried by Robert Emil and his reported French Huguenot ancestry.

With a town identified as a possible place of birth for Robert Emil, a birth or baptismal record from this time and place could be instrumental in identifying his parents. While no original records have been located, an authored narrative in the form of a "family book" compiled using church records of Friedrichsdorf, was located. The following family is listed (see Table 1):<sup>24</sup>

---

for marriage record with New Jersey State Archives but they are significantly delayed. Travel to Trenton not feasible at this time.

<sup>18</sup> Borough of Queens, New York, Department of Health, death certificate, certificate no. 4381 (1945), Robert E. Garnier.

<sup>19</sup> Ibid.

<sup>20</sup> "Pomerania, Germany, Passenger Lists, 1869-1901," database with images, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/2452/>; accessed 19 October 2021), departing passenger manifest, SS *Western Metropolis*, departing 15 June 1870, Stetten to New York, entry for Auguste Kornstaedt; citing Greifswald State Archives.

<sup>21</sup> JewishGen Gazetteer search tool, *JewishGen* (<https://www.jewishgen.org/communities/LocTown.asp>; accessed 15 October 2021) using search terms Friedricdorf for locality and Germany as country, noting eight results.

<sup>22</sup> "Friedrichsdorf," *Wikipedia* (<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Friedrichsdorf>; accessed 15 October 2021).

<sup>23</sup> Ibid.

<sup>24</sup> Family History Library Remote Lookup, 20 October 2021 email to Michelle Torosian from FamilySearch LookUp Team stating that no entries were found for an Emil Robert or Robert Emil Garnier born 1865-1866 in "Kirchenbuch [Churchbooks], 1629-1875" microfilm, DGS 102103623, Family History Library, Salt Lake City, Utah. Baptismal records in this collection do not extend later than 1834.

Steffen Martin, Registration Office, Friedrichsdorf, Germany ([steffen.martin@friedrichsdorf.de](mailto:steffen.martin@friedrichsdorf.de)) to Michelle Torosian, email, 22 November 2021, stating that no birth records or baptismal records from that time period are held by the town of Friedrichsdorf.

"Baden and Hesse Germany, Lutheran Baptisms, Marriages, and Burials, 1502-1985," online database, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/61060/>; accessed 20 November 2021) also searched for Emil or Robert Garnier, born 1865 +/- 1 year with no relevant results.

Additionally, email sent 16 October 2021 from Michelle Torosian to various staff members of Evangelische Kirchengemeinde Friedrichsdorf, the Protestant church in Friedrichsdorf that existed at the time requesting assistance were not replied to.

<b>Table 1: Excerpt from <i>Hessische Familienbücher</i> [<i>Hessian Family Books</i>]</b>			
<b>Name</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Marriage</b>	<b>Death</b>
Garnier, Frederic Alexandre / Lehrer	31.05.1823		11.04.1878
I. Rousselet, Susanne Elise	16.05.1822	<u>01.05.1849</u>	01.07.1853
1. Albert Arthur	18.01.1851		25.11.1889
II. Lotz, Marie Marguerite	20.01.1831	<u>28.09.1854</u>	05.05.1875
2. Chretien Frederic Louis	29.11.1855	14.03.1894	02.12.1936
3. Marie Frederique Elise	14.03.1857	19.09.1876	
4. Henriette Sophie	13.06.1858		
5. Maurice Albert	25.08.1859		11.01.1860
6. Adele Lucie	12.12.1860		
7. Augustine Sophie Hortense	18.03.1862		19.05.1862
8. Emile Alexandre	24.05.1863		
9. Emile Victor	12.09.1864	29.09.1892	28.07.1935 Homburg
<b>10. Emile Robert</b>	<b>09.11.1866</b>		
11. Marie Armine Alwine	26.07.1867		
12. Emma Julie	03.06.1869		
13. Elisabeth Louise	15.11.1870		
III. Achard, Christine Pauline	24.05.1835	<u>17.10.1876</u>	12.07.1892

*Source:* Angelika Schroeder, Essen, Germany (email address for private use), to Michelle Torosian, email, 24 January 2018, “Emile Robert Garnier”; Garnier Family files, privately held by Torosian, [mictorosian@yahoo.com](mailto:mictorosian@yahoo.com) [street address for private use], Briarcliff Manor, New York; attached file “See AUszeg Garnier.doc,” described as excerpt from book *Hessische Familienbücher* [*Hessian Family Books*] by Gottlieb See. Note, column titles added for clarity as well as bold font for Emile Robert for emphasis.

## Garniers In Germany

Could the Emile Robert listed as the son of Frederic Alexander Garnier and his second wife Marie Marguerite Lotz be the same man known as Robert Emil Garnier who had been married to Augusta? The month and date of birth are identical, however the birth year on this compilation is one year later than the date known to be Robert Emil’s birthdate. Could that be an error in transcription during the writing of this compilation?

It is notable that in the listing of siblings’ birthdays, the next sibling, Marie Armine Alwine is listed as having a birthday of 26 July 1867. This date is only 37 weeks later than the birthday of 9 November 1866 listed for Emile Robert.<sup>25</sup> While a subsequent pregnancy if delivered prematurely could be 37 weeks after an earlier delivery, it seems extremely unlikely. It is more likely that one of these dates contains an error. If there is an error, it is most likely in recording Emile Robert’s; the birthdate for Marie Armine Alwine is corroborated with her death certificate, which lists Marie Armine Alwine as being born 26 July 1867 in Friedrichsdorf to father Frederic Alexander Garnier

<sup>25</sup> Weeks calculated using “Days Calculator: Days Between Two Dates” tool, [timeanddate.com](http://timeanddate.com) (<https://www.timeanddate.com/date/duration.html> : accessed 17 October 2021).

and mother Maria Margaretha (Lotz) Garnier.<sup>26</sup> While the mother’s first name is listed as Maria instead of Marie, and the middle name does not match exactly, Margaretha and Marguerite are phonetically similar enough to presume they are the same person, especially in consideration of the other information that matches exactly.

Other information detailed in the *Hessische Familienbücher* can also be corroborated with other source documentation, including for the brother born prior to Emile Robert, who is listed as Emile Victor. The record of Emile Victor’s marriage to Mathilde Ernestine Otilie Achard lists his birthdate as 12 September 1864, their wedding date as 29 September 1892, and his parents as Friedrich Alexander Garnier and Marie Margarethe Lotz.<sup>27</sup> Although the parents’ first and middle names do not match exactly, they appear to be the German versions of their originally French names with identical last names as listed in the *Hessische Familienbücher*. Emile Victor’s birth and marriage dates in the marriage record match the birth and marriage dates listed for him in the *Hessische Familienbücher* perfectly. The death record for Emile Victor Garnier lists he was born in Friedrichsdorf, died 28 July 1935 in Homburg at age 70, and his widow’s maiden name as Achard. The widow’s maiden name is consistent with their marriage record. The age is consistent with his birth in September 1864 (See Table 2.).

	<i>Hessische Familienbücher</i>	Marriage Record <sup>a</sup>	Death Record <sup>b</sup>
Name	Emile Victor Garnier	Emile Victor Garnier	Emile Victor Garnier
Date of birth	12 September 1864	12 September 1864	Age 70, or between 28 July 1864-27 July 1865
Father’s name	Frederic Alexandre Garnier	Friedrich Alexander Garnier	
Mother’s name	Marie Marguerite Lotz	Marie Margarethe Lotz	
Marriage date	29 September 1892	29 September 1892	
Wife’s name		Mathilde Ernestine Otilie Achard	M[?] E[?] Otilie Achard
Death date	28 July 1935		28 July 1935
Place of death	Homburg		Bad Homburg vor der Höhe <sup>c</sup>
a. Friedrichsdorf, Hesse marriage certificate no. 6 (1892), Garnier-Achard; “Hesse, Germany, Marriages, 1849-1930,” online database with images, <i>Ancestry</i> ( <a href="https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/61118/">https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/61118/</a> : accessed 20 November 2021), citing Hessisches Hauptstaatsarchiv, Wiesbaden Germany.			

<sup>26</sup> Friedrichsdorf death certificate 15 (1951), Marie Armine Alwine (Garnier) Kehrer [indexed as Marie Christine Alwine Kehrer]; “Hesse, Germany, Deaths, 1851-1958,” database with images, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/61119/> : accessed 19 October 2021); citing Hessisches Hauptstaatsarchiv, Wiesbaden, Germany.

<sup>27</sup> Friedrichsdorf, Hesse marriage certificate no. 6 (1892), Garnier-Achard, Hessisches Hauptstaatsarchiv, Wiesbaden Germany; “Hesse, Germany, Marriages, 1849-1930,” online database with images, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/61118/> : accessed 20 November 2021).

- b. Bad Homburg, Hesse death certificate 176 (1935), Emile Victor Garnier; “Hesse, Germany, Deaths, 1851-1958,” online database with images, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/61119/> : accessed 20 November 2021); citing Hessisches Landesarchiv, Marburg, Germany.
- c. “Bad Homburg,” *Wikipedia* ([https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bad\\_Homburg](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bad_Homburg) : accessed 20 November 2021). Article notes “"vor der Hohe” is used to distinguish that this Homburg is the one within the district of Hochtaunuskries. This is the same district Friedrichsdorf is located within.

For several of the siblings, including Emile Robert, the corresponding marriage and death dates are not given. These blank fields could indicate that they left Friedrichsdorf, and any marriage and/or death dates were not recorded in the Friedrichsdorf church records from which this compilation was drawn.

### Establishing A Sibling’s Family to Connect the Two Families

For the sister listed in the *Hessische Familienbücher* as Henriette Sophie Garnier, a digital image of her original baptismal certificate was examined. Written in French, it notes that Henriette Sophie Garnier was born to Frederic Alexandre Garnier and his second wife, Marie Marguerite (nee Lotz).<sup>28</sup> She is described as his fourth child, the third from this marriage, and the second daughter. The month of her birth was clearly written as Juin (June) and the year is clearly “mil huit cent cinquante huit” (one thousand eight hundred fifty-eight, or 1858).<sup>29</sup> The day, however, is written over a fold in the document and appears to either say treize (thirteen) or trois (three).<sup>30</sup> With the minor uncertainty of the exact date, this baptismal certificate seems consistent with the excerpt from the *Hessische Familienbücher* as to both Henriette Sophie’s parents and place within the birth and gender order of her siblings.

Henriette Sophie did leave Friedrichsdorf. She married a man named Philipp Lutz, a pastor. They traveled to various churches throughout Germany for his preaching.<sup>31</sup> Philipp and Henriette Sophie, who went by Sophie, had several children together, including a son, Friedrich Wilhelm Lutz.<sup>32</sup> Sophie’s death certificate lists her death as occurring in Berlin in 1918, her husband as Philipp Lutz, her birthplace as Friedrichsdorf, and her parents as Frederic Alexander Garnier and Marie Marguerite Lotz.<sup>33</sup> Her age at death is listed as 60, which is consistent with her birth in 1858.<sup>34</sup>

---

<sup>28</sup> Evangelische Kirchengemeinde Friedrichsdorf (Evangelical Church Friedrichsdorf) (Friedrichsdorf, Germany), baptismal certificate number 14, Henriette Sophie Garnier baptism (1858); pdf “Garnier H S Baptism Certificate 2”, “Hancock Family Tree,” by username leoniejupp, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/family-tree/person/tree/17513308/person/18024868717/gallery> : accessed 17 October 2021).

<sup>29</sup> Ibid.

<sup>30</sup> Ibid.

<sup>31</sup> Leanne French to Michelle Torosian, instant message via *Ancestry.com*, 21 January 2018; privately held by Michelle Torosian [address for private use], Briarcliff Manor, New York, 2021.

<sup>32</sup> Ibid.

<sup>33</sup> Berlin, Germany, death record 689 (1918), Sophie Lutz (Garnier), Landesarchiv Berlin, Berlin, Germany; “Berlin, Germany, Deaths, 1874-1955,” database with images, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/2958/> : accessed 19 October 2021).

<sup>34</sup> Ibid.

Born 16 April 1888 in Berlin, the birth certificate of Friedrich Wilhelm Lutz records his father as Philip Andreas Dionys Lutz, his mother as Henriette Sofie Lutz (born Garnier).<sup>35</sup> This is corroborated by his entry in a city marriage registry, which lists his name as Friedrich W. Lutz, parents as Philip A.D. and Sophie, and place of birth as Berlin in 1888.<sup>36</sup> When Friedrich Wilhelm Lutz petitioned to become a U.S. citizen in 1917, he listed that he was born in Berlin on 16 April 1888 and that he arrived in New York, New York on 1 November 1905 aboard the vessel *Neckar*.<sup>37</sup> At his death in 1950, his death certificate also records his date and place of birth as 16 April 1888 in Berlin, Germany, to parents Philip Lutz and mother Sophie Garnier.<sup>38</sup> It is possible that he was given the name Friedrich in honor of his mother's father, Frederic, although in the German rather than French version of the name.

### Extended Family Reunited

As claimed in the Petition for Naturalization for Friedrich Wilhelm Lutz, a 17-year-old Friedrich W. Lutz arrived at Ellis Island on 1 November 1905 on the S.S. *Neckar*.<sup>39</sup> The age and date on the passenger manifest allows for the calculation of this passenger's birth as between of 2 November 1887- 1 November 1888, which is consistent with Friedrich Wilhelm's birth date of 16 April 1888. Very notably, the passenger manifest records that Friedrich W. Lutz is going to join his uncle, "Rob. E. Garnier" of 827 Madison Street, Brooklyn.<sup>40</sup>

Five months earlier in 1905, New York State had conducted its state census. Robert Garnier and his family were enumerated as living at 827 Madison Street, Brooklyn (see Table 3).<sup>41</sup>

---

<sup>35</sup> Berlin, Germany, birth record number 350 (1888), Friedrich Wilhelm Lutz, Landesarchiv Berlin, Berlin, Germany [State Archives Berlin]; "Berlin, Germany, Births, 1874-1899," database with digital images, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/imageviewer/collections/5753/> : accessed 17 October 2021).

<sup>36</sup> "Virginia, U.S., Select Marriages, 1785-1940," database, *Ancestry* ([www.ancestry.com](http://www.ancestry.com) : accessed 17 October 2021, entry for Friedrich W. Lutz – Helen P. Schaaf, 6 December 1911); FHL film number 2048456, image 277. Also, Henrico, Virginia, Marriage Registers, 1874-1935, Family History Library film 2048456, image group number 7578209, digital image 289, received via email from FamilySearch Look Up team member Katherine Pincock 24 October 2021 to Michelle Dowd Torosian.

<sup>37</sup> U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of Virginia, Petition for Naturalization (1917), Friedrich Wilhelm Lutz, number 349 (inked), page 99 (stamped); "U.S., Naturalization Records, 1840-1957," online database with images, *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/search/collections/1193/> : accessed 20 November 2021); citing NARA microfilm publication M1647, roll 3.

<sup>38</sup> State Department of Health of New Jersey, death certificate 10031 (1950), Philip Lutz, New Jersey State Bureau of Vital Statistics; pdf of death certificate uploaded to profile for Friedrich Wilhelm Lutz, by Tracey Berg, "Berg Family Tree," *Ancestry* ([www.ancestry.com/family-tree/tree/88175823?cfpid=36566976375](http://www.ancestry.com/family-tree/tree/88175823?cfpid=36566976375) : accessed 17 October 2021).

<sup>39</sup> "New York Passengers Arrivals List (Ellis Island), 1892-1924" database with images, *FamilySearch.org* (<https://www.familysearch.org/ark:/61903/3:1:3Q9M-C9PR-TCFX?i=568&cc=1368704> : accessed 17 October 2021), manifest, S.S. *Neckar*, Bremen to New York, arriving 1 November 1905, entry for Friedrich W. Lutz; citing NARA series T715, roll 637.

<sup>40</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>41</sup> 1905 New York State census, Kings County, Brooklyn, election district 32, block B and C, page 13 (inked), Robert Garnier household; "New York, State Census, 1905," database with images; *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/imageviewer/collections/7364/> : accessed 17 October 2021); citing New York State Archives, Albany, New York.



<b>Name</b>	<b>Relationship</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Occupation</b>
Garnier, Robert	head	39	Germany	artist
Augusta	wife	37	Germany	housework
Eliza	daughter	17	U.S.	typewriter
Irving	son	10	U.S.	at school

*Source:* 1905 New York State census, Kings County, Brooklyn, election district 32, block B and C, page 13 (inked), Robert Garnier household; “New York, State Census, 1905,” database with images; *Ancestry* (<https://www.ancestry.com/imageviewer/collections/7364/> : accessed 17 October 2021); citing New York State Archives, Albany, New York. Note census taken as of June 1, 1905.

The age of 39 as of June 1, 1905 is consistent with Robert Emil’s birthdate of 9 November 1865, as is his place of birth of Germany. His wife, Augusta is enumerated with him. His children’s names vary slightly, with his daughter Elsie’s name being recorded as the similar sounding Eliza. Robert Irving, sharing a first name with his father, is listed by his middle name. Their living in Brooklyn and Robert Emil’s occupation as an artist are consistent with the newspaper article that described their life together. The Robert Garnier living at 827 Madison Street in Brooklyn is clearly the same Robert Emil Garnier who would pass away in 1945.

**Linking the Garnier Family Together**

Although Robert Emil Garnier’s death certificate states his father was named Emil Garnier, the parents of Robert Emil Garnier were most likely Frederic Alexandre Garnier of Friedrichsdorf, Germany, and his second wife, Marie Marguerite Lotz.

The informant for the death certificate was Robert’s widow, Augusta, who almost certainly never met her husband’s parents. Robert may not have remembered their names himself, given that he was only nine years old when Marie Marguerite died and twelve years old when Frederic Alexandre died.<sup>42</sup>

The single page of the *Hessische Familienbücher* that lists Frederic Alexandre and Marie Marguerite as the parents of an Emile Robert, born 9 November 1866, could be considered weak evidence as it is a compilation of church records. In comparison to vital records related to their daughter Henriette Sophie Garnier, however, it appears accurate. Both her baptismal record and death record point to the same parents, place of birth, and date of birth as is listed for her in the page from *Hessische Familienbücher*. The *Hessische Familienbücher* information presented for younger sister Marie Armine Alwine is consistent with her death certificate. Similarly, the

---

<sup>42</sup> For Marie Marguerite Lotz’s date of death, Schroeder to Torosian email, 24 January 2018, excerpt from book *Hessische Familienbücher [Hessian Family Books]* by Gottlieb See. For Frederic Alexandre Garnier’s date of death, *Find A Grave* (<https://www.findagrave.com/memorial/197148692/fr%C3%A9d%C3%A9ric-alexandre-garnier> : accessed 20 November 2021), memorial page 197148692, for Frederic Alexandre Garnier, created by DianaMC, gravestone (Hauptfriedhof [Main Cemetery], Friedrichsdorf, Germany), digital image, 27 February 2019, by DianaMC, noting birth date of 31 May 1823 and death date of 11 April 1878.

information presented for older brother Emile Victor is consistent with his marriage and death records.

It seems clear that Friedrich Wilhelm Lutz was the son of Henriette Sophie Garnier and her husband, Philipp Lutz. Friedrich's birth certificate, marriage index listing, and death certificate all support that he was the son of Henriette Sophie, or more simply Sophie, (Garnier) Lutz.

When Friedrich immigrated to the United States, his record in the passenger manifest clearly lists the relative he joined in the U.S. was his uncle Robert E. Garnier in Brooklyn, at the same exact address at which Robert Emil Garnier and his family were enumerated earlier that same year. With the relationship uncle, Friedrich has identified that Robert is either the brother and/or brother-in-law of Friedrich's parents. As Garnier was Henriette Sophie's maiden name, and Augusta's maiden name was known to be Kornstedt, it is logical that Robert Emil was a brother to Friedrich's mother Henriette Sophie.

### Resolving Conflicts with *Hessische Familienbücher*

The Emile Robert Garnier listed in the *Hessische Familienbücher* is listed as having a birthdate of 9 November 1866. While the year is off by one digit to the 9 November 1865 birthdate of Robert Emil Garnier, the day and month are the same, and the possible error in the year could be an error in transcription. This is supported by the subsequent sibling being born less than a pregnancy's typical forty weeks after 9 November 1866.

The difference in names, Robert Emil as opposed to Emile Robert, could be related to the fact that the *Hessische Familienbücher* lists three brothers with the first name of Emile. To avoid confusion, the second and third brothers with that name may have been called by their middle names, or all of them may have been called by their middle names. In some regions of Germany, children would be baptized with two or more names, and when brothers shared a first name, they would often all go by their second name.<sup>43</sup>

### Conclusion

If Henriette Sophie and Robert Emil were siblings, then the parents of Henriette Sophie were the parents of Robert Emil. The information from the *Hessische Familienbücher* when taken in conjunction with other evidence regarding the relationships between Robert Emil, Henriette Sophie, and Friedrich Wilhelm, supports that Robert Emil Garnier was most likely the same child of Frederic Alexandre Garnier and his second wife, Marie Marguerite Lotz, that was baptized as Emile Robert Garnier in Friedrichsdorf, Germany.

---

<sup>43</sup> "Germany Personal Names: Given Names," *Family Search Wiki* ([https://www.familysearch.org/wiki/en/Germany\\_Personal\\_Names](https://www.familysearch.org/wiki/en/Germany_Personal_Names) : accessed 15 November 15, 2021).